### Chapter 1

# Official Multilingualis as a Public Policy: The Case of the Republic of South Africa 8

Bilal Yalçinkaya<sup>1</sup> M. Ali Göngen<sup>2</sup>

#### **Abstract**

Public policy analysis is a social science discipline applied to better understand the policy-making processes and their consequences. In this study, it is aimed to reveal the analysis of the official multilingualism policy by examining the reasons, stages and results of the applied policy. Language policy is a component of public policy studies, and country-by-country review and planning of language policy make an important contribution to this topic. This study firstly addresses the classification of language policy tools and how they are used as a public policy tool. Then come its examination, classification in the public policy of the Republic of South Africa and the interpretation of its results. This article contributes to research on the development, implementation and consequences of language policy by discussing the place of the concept of official multilingualism in public policy and how it can be adapted to research. In other words, it is about examining the concept through a case analysis after the thematic analysis performed in the study. Then, a method is created to compare and examine language policies through the example of the Republic of South Africa.

Max Weber suggests that language invites to unification but does not enforce it in the process of nation formation. The South African Republic, described as 'Rainbow Nation', accepted the invitation of various languages and combined it in the constitution as the common text. In addition, official languages were established in the provinces in proportion to their populations and became practicable in the entire state apparatus including the fields of education, health and communication. The language(s) harboring diversity and secessionism thus became the cement for the coexistence of

<sup>1</sup> Dr. Avukat, Bağımsız Araştırmacı, ORCID: 0000-0002-8226-6050, av.bilalkaya@gmail.com

<sup>2</sup> Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Gaziantep Üniversitesi, ORCID: 0000-0003-2931-2967, maligongen@ hotmail.com

various communities. The main objective with the recognition of 11 official languages is to prove that language would grow secessionist once ostracized, but associative once included in the state. Official multilingualism is the greatest inspiration for various communities to live in the same country without losing the sense of belonging and to hold on to the commitment for coexistence in spite of all the problems experienced in society.

#### 1. Introduction

This study analyzes the influence of official multilingualism as a public policy on social peace in a country. Regardless of the fact that demands for the recognition of other languages in a country with one official language are considered a political initiative, it is essentially not any different from the other public services offered in that country. Provision of public services like electricity and water- which are offered in the same quality everywhere as a means of public policies- in a way that considers the diversities in society, and development of corresponding public policies do have remarkable influence on social peace. South African Republic is a country that has tested it with 11 official languages since 1994. This process that began in 1994 is one of the most outstanding public policies that are implemented most successfully in the country today.

The various ethnic components of the country having their mother tongue recognized as official and receiving public services in their mother languages is not a means of division as is widely thought but a means of integration. The fundamental output of public services is to meet citizens' demands and to reconcile social conflicts by establishing consensus (Yıldız & Sobacı, 2013, p.17). The language element offered in this framework serves as an associative factor, especially in places where society comprises differences at class level and in places where society is made up of communities intertwined with each other. In this sense, language meets the expectations of various groups to become a state and forestalls the search for another state. In this scope, basing on the diversity of languages in India and the linguistic federalism formed over them, Indian political scientist Rajni Kothari suggests that "the language was ceased to be a secessionist factor and was successfully transformed into cement that holds society together" (1970, p.115). Public services are not just materially provided works, since they harbour moral elements as well. Services provided with language involvement are of importance within this context.

This study tries to clarify the subject through an examination of the 'Study of Administration' by Woodrow Wilson, a foundation article in the field of public administration, citing authors who dealt with public policy such as linguist Noam Chomsky, political scientist Harold Lasswell, Rajni Kothari and Frederick Taylor who is considered the founder of scientific public administration.

Mother tongue also corresponds to a domination of a different world. According to Fanon, the possession of language implies empowerment as it confirms peoples' cultural adequacy. Possession of a language is possession of the world of that language. Paul Valery describes language as 'the god gone astray in the flesh' (Fanon, 2009, p.12). People cannot choose their nation from birth, nor their mother tongue. The structure of a language also contains a past and a cultural background. A public service offered upon this background facilitates the individual's connection with the past. The concept of nationality was built over language. As in English, the most common language in the world, the name of a nation and its language are denoted by the same concept.

The number of states can never reach the number of languages worldwide. A wide variety of languages are used within the boundaries that have been drawn up with the birth of nation-states. An integration of these into the system through assimilation is neither humane nor could always produce favorable results. In a country with one common tongue, provision of public services to citizens in their local languages would not lead to a separation but could only be a key for coalescence as it consolidates the sense of belonging.

The biggest issues at the present time arise not between states but mainly in the form of intrastate conflicts. Of the total 110 armed conflicts experienced in the world from 1989 to 1999, only 7 were intercountry wars. The rest 103 cases were intrastate conflicts that primarily centered on ethnic issues (Wallensteen & Sollenberg, 2000). Since the denial of ethnical belongings lies at the root of these conflicts, softening the nation-state criteria and giving prominence to linguistic rights might well avert these conflicts.

In this scope, the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages was opened for signature on November 5, 1992 and entered into force on March 1, 1998. The first article of the charter ratified by European countries defines "regional or minority languages" as those that are "traditionally used within a given territory of a State by nationals of that State who form a group numerically smaller than the rest of the State's population". A majority of the European states, 33 of them, signed the charter but 25 of these ratified it after a parliamentary approval. 14 other states in Europe did not sign the charter (Hukuk Book, 2021). Despite the fact that Europe has the highest number of divided and small countries and intersecting borders of state nations, the sensitivity it revealed nevertheless with regard to the

languages of various groups is of importance in terms of compensating for the democracy deficit caused by nation-state.

Nation-state is identified with one language, yet this is not an absolute truth. Different languages that are shaped in flesh and bones with the state's reality, become parts of a whole in the course of time. For instance, there are many official languages in the state and canton system of Switzerland where the concept of nation refers to all these official languages. There is a similar situation in Canada where the nation forms two parts of a whole that speaks both English and French, one of which by itself doesn't suffice to define Canada.

# 2. Analysis of Public Services in The Context of Public Policies

Harold Lasswell defines public policy as "a projected program of goals, values, and practices" (1951, p.5). The resolution of public issues requires a determination of public policies that accord those matters. In this context, the process should ground on clarifying the role of science, embracing assumptions that correspond to the nature of science and using these as the base (Orhan, 2013, p.68). What lies behind the public policies is the motive to meet the society's needs. Frohock, on the other hand, presents a wide spectrum suggesting that public policies could concern many subjects such as justice, tax, social security, housing, health and education (1979, p.15). Woodrow Wilson, in his foundation article in the field of public administration, 'The Study Of Administration', states that, "The principles on which to base a science of administration must be principles which have democratic policy very much at heart." (1887, p.17). The essence of democratic rules corresponds to embracing the entire society. The article is of great importance in terms of bringing a perspective to future, even though America was not in such a state by the time of its writing.

Public policies refer to the whole of the practices performed by the state in accordance with the society's needs that emerge in line with the changing time. The massive urbanization that started with the process of nation-states and industrialization resulted in human needs being regarded as a whole and these sort of becoming the reason of state. This is related with the fact that politicians are meant to provide the public services needed by society to make sure that the legitimacy they have won through elections resumes. In the contrary case, the legitimacy of the elected politicians, who fail to meet these needs, becomes a matter of debate.

The approach of 'good governance', developed basing on the 'New Public Service', also makes up the deficiencies of the 'New Public Management'. The

'good governance', also defined as 'transferring state power to people', is also represented as multiparty democracy, respect for human rights, rule of law, transparent and accountable administration, powerful civil society, culture of advanced democracy and local administration (Eryılmaz, 2011, pp.53-54). Transferring the state power to people also means expanding the power to grassroots, which means establishing an administration close to the people's values. While a top-down administration brings about uniformity, the administration's getting closer to people's values will generate pluralism and diversity and this represents the formation of administration in accordance with the people's values.

In developed countries like England, U.S. and Germany, the central government establishes the framework of the policies that concern subjects like housing, education and police services, while local administrations are vested with responsibility for practices. In countries away from democracy where a strict state tradition prevails, implementation of public policies and services might be faced with this strict bureaucracy (Çevik, 2013, pp. 273-279).

The process of nation formation has also brought with it the process of uniformity over language. Its reflection in daily life is represented by the expansion of one language in all areas of life and subordination of other languages by the hand of the state. It is obvious that this can only be made possible through assimilation, since the concept of state did never dominate all areas of life before nation-state. For this reason, languages could easily find a life space for themselves. However, once the state ruled over all areas of life with the nation-state concept, the languages that were denied usage in public sphere ended up regressing and this gave birth to assimilation and conflict environment. Assimilation gave rise to this conflict environment as it is mainly applied by means of violence, sovereignty and repression and in spite of the choices of the non-sovereign language groups (Koçak, 2013, p.269). The approach of the states in this regard has played a determining role as to whether they seek for a conflict or a resolution. After all, the state's imposition of one language could also be interpreted as its willingness for a conflict from the beginning. It is also obvious that the struggle of the language groups that are not included in the concept of state will not be fair at all. This is also the answer as to how much the state's founding philosophy bases on democracy. The state's reflex to this demand - whether the issue will be treated over criminal law or human rights law - is associated with what the state understands of democracy. Ulusoy suggests that democratization and meeting of local demands is interrelated (2020, p.112). To put it

another way, failure to meet the local demands means growing away from democracy.

Implementation of public policies in local languages does not only make public services more meaningful but also serves as a substantial factor in softening up the conflict environment. In this context, the difference in the essence of language, our main argument, risks secessionism as long as is excluded from the state. As Rajni Kothari puts it, 'the secessionism potential of a language will turn into a unification potential as long as it remains a language of education and official in a state'. Briefly stated, as opposed to popular belief, language grows secessionist when excluded from the state but ceases to be so and becomes the recipe for unity when reconciled with laws. Why would the secessionist want to settle in the state after all? In this sense, provision of services in various languages consolidates the sense of belonging and facilitates unification. In consideration of the innate diversities born by the nature, it is only obvious that imposition of one language in a country with various ethnic groups would be against the nature. Its human and psychological dimension should not be forgotten either. A school-age child being forced to change his mother tongue after starting the school will not only give cause for personality problems but might also sow the seeds of an inner conflict for his future.

In this regard, many thinkers have highlighted the relationship between language and thought and the importance of language for the self-realization of individuals. According to Chomsky, who defines language as the most significant component of human mind, people can produce ideationally thanks to the language feature. According to him, a native speaker also internalizes the generative grammar of the language and this ability with the mother tongue is innate (Chomsky, 2013, p.358). According to Will Kymlicka, the instrumental function of language can be achieved best in the native languages of individuals. In other words, the culture and language of the individual are needed in order for an individual to realize himself/herself at utmost level, from basic vital needs to all social necessities. Wittgenstein, who puts language at the center of human's vision and perception of world, influentially highlights the relationship between language and idea with his saying 'the limits of my language mean the limits of my world' (Utku, 2004, p.5).

In social context, respect for this diversity becomes a pattern in multilingual societies where various languages are spoken in everyday life. In addition, in societies where multiculturalism is adopted, xenophobia stands at the lowest level thanks to contact with other cultures (Ball, 2010, p.10).

On the other hand, the state's language policy is not bounded with language alone. Since language and culture are interrelated elements, multilingualism, multiculturalism and consequently pluralist democracy are concepts that associate with each other (Ergil, 2016, pp.205-209).

Despite the fact that the states' language policies differ depending on countries, a look at the concrete situation on the world shows that multilingualism is no exception. For instance, English and French are the official languages of Canada, while French, Germany and Italian are the official languages in Switzerland. The Spanish state, where the official language is Castilian, enables the usage of two languages, as well as education in both, in the regions inhabited by different culture and language groups. French is the official language in Luxembourg where, however, Luxembourgish is recognized as national language. In Belgium, there are autonomous regions and regional administrations where different languages are used. The Constitution of France recognizes French as the official language, yet local languages are also recognized and instructed at schools. In Senegal with French as the official language, Wolof is a national language, and the state allows it to be instructed at schools. Similarly, in Zimbabwe, English is the official language while Shona is the most widely spoken national language. India also is a country divided into 28 states based on languages.

Within this framework, UNESCO supports multilingualism and thus mother tongue education for three basic principles. First, UNESCO supports mother tongue instruction as a means of improving educational quality by building upon the knowledge and experience of the learners and teachers. Second, UNESCO supports bilingual and/or multilingual education at all levels of education as a means of promoting both social and gender equality and as a key element of linguistically diverse societies. Third, UNESCO supports language as an essential component of inter-cultural education in order to encourage understanding between different population groups and ensure respect for fundamental rights. In addition, according to UNESCO, every pupil should begin his/her formal education in his/her mother tongue and learn a second language thereafter (UNESCO, 2003, p.30). Starting life with the language that one knows best does not only enable a quicker comprehension of life but also his cognitive abilities help him interpret future more easily (Beukes, 2009, p.50). To put it in contrary way, not starting the school and education with mother tongue comes to mean a high probability of future problems. In the South African Republic, mother tongue education remains at the forefront at primary and secondary school, while this is replaced by English at high school and university (Nomlomo & Katiya, 2018, p.78).

## 3. Official Multilingualism in The Republic of South Africa and Its Reflections on Public Policies

The Republic of South Africa went down in history as the country with the longest history of racism. After British and Dutch colonization, the colonial system was turned into racist state system, by the British in 1910 and by the Dutch in 1948 and this continued till 1994. (BBC, 2023). The New Constitution drawn up between 1994 and 1996 provided the legal foundation for the modern Republic of South Africa.

The establishment of provinces in the Republic of South Africa has historical backgrounds. While the provinces of Free State and Transvaal (currently Gauteng) were established by the Boers<sup>3</sup> who were forced to migrate to the North with the arrival of the British at the island, the British founded the provinces of Natal (currently KwaZulu-Natal) and Cape (currently Western Cape) in the South. Today, according to the Article 103 (1) of the Constitution, (Constitution of The Republic of South Africa, 1996); the Republic of South Africa consists of 9 provinces: Western Cape, Eastern Cape, Northern Cape, North West, Free State, Kwazulu Natal, Gauteng, Limpopo and Mpumalanga. The country is home to English- and Afrikaans-speaking Whites and Blacks consisting of 9 tribes. Some of the races extend massively to certain areas, yet there is also an overall distribution. The boundaries of provinces during establishment were drawn not in accordance with the races but with the languages spoken by the majority.

Table 1. Distribution of the 11 Official Languages in the Republic of South Africa by Population

Group	Percentage (%)	Group	Percentage (%)
Zulu	23.8	Sesotho	7,9
Xhosa	17.6	Xitsonga	4.4
Afrikaans	13.3	Siswati	2.7
Sepedi	9.4	Tshivenda	2.3
English	8.2	Ndebele	1.6
Setswana	8.2	Other	0.6

Source: www.busvannah.co.za

<sup>3 (</sup>Dutch: "farmer"), a South African of Dutch, German, or Huguenot descent, especially one of the early settlers of the Transvaal and the Orange Free State. Today, descendants of the Boers are commonly referred to as Afrikaners. They were called so since the first settlers in 1652 lived mainly by farming.

The ethnical diversity in South Africa is reflected in language diversity, still language is at the same time a classification for ethnical definition within the larger "Africa" group. While the Blacks constitute a clear majority, there doesn't exist such a single group domination in terms of language. Zulu is the most widely spoken language (23,8 %) and is followed by Xhosa. Afrikaans, spoken by both the Whites and a larger part of the mixed-race population rank number three, is followed by Spedi and English. Other languages - Swati, Tshivenda, Ndebele and others- are spoken by fewer people. Still, language use depends on provinces. For instance, over 80 % of the population in Eastern Cape speaks Xhosa and KwaZulu, while in Natal over 80 % uses Zulu as mother tongue. Afrikaans, on the other hand, is the language of the majority in Western Cape and Northern Cape. Free State, Limpopo and North West are dominated by languages such as Sesotho, Setswana and Sepedi. In Gauteng, the most cosmopolitan province of South Africa, a language does not constitute the majority. (Murray & Simeon, 2007, p.704, cited by Yalçinkaya, 2020, p.166).

¥ 22.7% 16.0% 13.5% English Tswana **₹8.0%** 9.6% Tsonga 4.5% 2.5%

Figure 1. Population Ratio in the Republic of South Africa and Distribution of Languages by Provinces

Source: (Maps on the Web, 2016).

The language groups spoken by large populations within the boundaries of the provinces in the Republic of South Africa are granted with an official status. The population speaking the official languages make up over 90 % of the total population. This status is secured by the constitution of the country.

Province	Official Languages
Eastern Cape	English, Xhosa, Afrikaans and Sotho
Free State	English, Sotho, Afrikaans and Xhosa
Gauteng	English, Zulu, Afrikaans and Sotho
KwaZulu -Natal	English, Zulu, Xhosa and Afrikaans
Mpumalanga	English, Swati, Tsonga and Ndebele
Northern Cape	English, Afrikaans, Tswana and Xhosa
Limpopo	English, Sepedi, Tsonga and Venda
North West	English, Tswana, Afrikaans and Sotho
Western Cape	English, Afrikaans, Xhosa and Sotho

Table 2. Official Languages Spoken in Provinces

Source: (Minister of Justice And Correctional Services, 2019).

According to Section 6, the longest in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa,

"The official languages of the Republic are Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, Siswati, Tshivenda, Xitsonga, Afrikaans, English, isiNdebele, isiXhosa and isiZulu." The 2nd clause reads, "Recognising the historically diminished use and status of the indigenous languages of our people, the state must take practical and positive measures to elevate the status and advance the use of these languages." The 3rd clause, which allocates responsibility to local governments in relation to multilingualism, reads, "The national government and each provincial government must use at least two official languages. Municipalities must take into account the language usage and preferences of their residents."

A 'Pan South African Language Board' was established to promote and create conditions for the development and use of all official languages and the Khoi, Nama and San languages which have been driven into oblivion and the ancient languages that tribal languages are originated from, according to Section 5. Clause (a) (Constitution of The Republic of South Africa, 1996). Section 29 (2) reads,

"Everyone has the right to receive education in the official language or languages of their choice in public educational institutions where that education is reasonably practicable. In order to ensure the effective access to, and implementation of, this right, the state must consider all reasonable educational alternatives, including single medium institutions." Section 31. (1) reads, "Persons belonging to a cultural, religious or linguistic community may not be denied the right, with other members of that community (a) to enjoy their culture, practise their religion and use their language; and (b) to form, join and maintain cultural, religious and linguistic associations and other organs of civil society." Under the title of 'Self-determination', Section 235 reads, "The right of the South African people as a whole to self-determination, as manifested in this Constitution, does not preclude, within the framework of this right, recognition of the notion of the right of self-determination of any community sharing a common cultural and language heritage, within a territorial entity in the Republic or in any other way, determined by national legislation."

Despite the fact that the division of both the Whites and the Blacks into various language groups in a state such as the Republic of South Africa might be considered a problem, a social consensus seems to have been achieved looking at the Constitution formed with the 1994 spirit and the politics in the country, as well as in the provision of municipal services in different languages. Now, let's take a look at the issue in opposite direction. Had some languages been banned in 1994, would the country have been able to create the atmosphere that exists today? Without doubt, it is not possible to give a definite answer to this question. However, when we look into the developments, it becomes evident that the peaceful coexistence in South Africa, which resembles a mosaic ethnically, owes to multilingualism. With the banning of PAC (Pan-Africanist Congress), SACPS (South African Communist Party) and ANC (African National Congress) in 1960 and the prohibition of languages other than English and Afrikaans that were used by the Whites in schools caused the Black Consciousness Movement led by Steve Biko to emerge as a movement for language and culture (Kgatla, 2016, p.26) Through mass protests against schools and government offices, the movement de facto rendered the country dysfunctional and forced the government to step back, as a result of which nobody in the country ever dared to impose a ban on a language again. In this respect, experts' definition of the interim Constitution formed in 1994 as semi-federal results from the

South African Republic's practices with respect to language. Some public services, including the language, are left to the initiative of provinces.

In the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality, the largest in the Eastern Cape Province in the Republic of South Africa, the population distribution is as follows; Afrikaans (29,7 %), Xhosa (57,3 %), English (12,1 %). The municipality offers services in three languages and the municipal structure is organized according to these three languages. Students from the 1st to the 12th grade are taught three languages at schools (Ohyama, 2018). In provinces with few official languages, more languages could well be used in municipal services.



Figure 2. Multilingual service at an ATM in the Republic of South Africa

Source: Photo from Bilal Yalçinkaya Archive

Banks provide service in all official languages in the country. This is related to an implementation of language practices in conformity with the public policies that were adopted in 1994 in the framework of public accord. Unless a language is given a market value, factors such as industry, education, production, consumption and government operational organs will cause that language to face a cognitive impoverishment. Through an integration of education and economy, language is transformed into a more active organism (Alexander, 2013, p.108) Language is at the same time a carrier of culture. The extinction or neutralization of a language also amounts to the neutralization of that language as a carrier of culture. (Chumbow, 2009). As Hartshorne puts it, mother tongue is the most distinctive feature of human beings. This has something to do with identity and position that distinguish

people and with the issue of sole power that enables individuals to realize themselves. The first and second additional languages to be built on this selfrealization will clearly get positioned better. The already existing language policy of the Republic of South Africa is of a nature that reflects this (1992, p.18).

The City of Tshwane metropolitan municipality, the largest in terms of economy and population, uses the highest number of languages (8) and provides services in all of these languages. The municipality assists non-English speaking residents orally in their language of origin through providing interpreting services in the native language to make sure that the persons in question do not face any difficulties with the language (Language Policy of The City of Tshwane, 2012, pp.5-8). In the case of the George Municipality, where 96 percent of the population speaks Afrikaans, Xhosa and English, there are three official languages and all official institutions are organized accordingly. Residents with other languages are provided with personnel to take care of their demands (George Municipality, 2016, p.4).

The public broadcaster, South Africa Broadcasting Corporation (SABC) owns three channels, which are SABC1, SABC2 and SABC3. Of these, SABC1 and SABC2 carry programming in the languages of the Blacks and also provide English subtitles. SABC1 broadcasts in Zulu, Xhosa, Swati and Ndebele from Nguni language group; SABC2 in Setswana, Northern Sotho, Southern Sotho, Tshivenda and Xitsonga from Sotho language group; SABC3 in Afrikaans and English, as well as in Nguni and Sotho at intervals. Of the 18 radio stations owned by the state, 5 broadcast in English (5FM Music, Good Hope FM, Metro FM, Radio 2000, SA FM and Lotus FM), and 9 in South African native languages; Zulu (Ukhozi FM), Xhosa (Umhlobo Wenene FM), Tshivenda (Phalaphala FM), Setswana (Motsweding FM), Ndebele (Ikwekwezi FM), Sesotho (Lesedi FM), Sepedi (Thobela FM), Xitsonga (Munghana Lonene FM) and Swati (Ligwalagwala FM). Another one (Tru fm) broadcasts in English and Xhosa (Ideh & Onu, 2017, pp.77-78).

Official multilingualism should be regarded as essential for but not obstacle to the achievement of national unity, development, political unity, nation building and social integration (Mazrui & Mazrui, 1998). In this context, besides the official regulation after 1994, language instruction was offered at courses for employees of universities, educational institutions, hospitals and other state institutions. Especially intermediate staff was raised to provide assistance institutionally in official languages and in other languages used in the province in question. For example, in the region of KwaZulu-Natal which

is mainly inhabited by Zulu people, English is accompanied by the Zulu language, while in Eastern Cape Province, the language of the Xhosa, the tribe of Nelson Mandela, comes to the fore. (Hlongwa & Mazibuko, 2016) In the case of South Africa, the multilingualism based on the recognition of 11 official languages as national values, should be seen as one of the most specific characteristics of the South African society. This tolerance, which emerged after hundreds of years of racist and discriminatory policies, could indeed set an example to the whole world (Pluddemann, 1997). Official multilingualism has a central position in the development of the economic, cultural, moral, political and educational benefits of the language as a natural resource. This reality is the primary cause that underlies access to all segments of society (Baker, 2011). The domination of English, the common tongue, continues (Kgatla, 2016, p.48). Parliamentary decisions are translated into all languages at national level, and into the official languages of all provinces demonstrated on Table 1 on municipal level (Sekhukhune District Municipality, 2017). South African citizens learn both their mother tongues and English, which means they have the advantage of living national values in their mother tongues and knowing English in international aspect. In the Republic of South Africa, one of the 8 countries where English is an official language and spoken by the majority among the total 54 countries in Africa, English language courses also provide a significant part of the source of income. It is the country with the highest revenue gained from language teaching in Africa (Possel & Zeller, 2016, p.13).

There are not only 11 languages in South Africa where 25 other languages are also spoken. English is not the language of the majority but is the common tongue between different groups since it is commonly taught at schools (Hazeltine, 2013, p.26). In addition, the Section 6 (5) (b) clause of the Constitution, (Constitution of The Republic of South Africa, 1996) sets it as a constitutional obligation to promote and ensure respect for;

(i) all languages commonly used by communities in South Africa, including German, Greek, Gujarati, Hindi, Portuguese, Tamil, Telegu and Urdu; and (ii) Arabic, Hebrew, Sanskrit and other languages used for religious purposes in South Africa. Section 185 of the Constitution reads, "The primary objects of the Commission for the Promotion and Protection of the Rights of Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Communities are (a) to promote respect for the rights of cultural, religious and linguistic communities; (b) to promote and develop peace, friendship, humanity, tolerance and national unity among cultural, religious and linguistic communities, on the basis of equality, non-discrimination and free association."

While the Republic of South Africa would often come up with unfavorable enforcements for many years, the constitutional works implemented after 1994 and the treatment of diversities as the parts of a whole has enabled the country to overcome these issues. The "Rainbow Nation" in the words of Desmond Tutu'<sup>4</sup>, exists with all of its colors and languages today. Despite the presence of some problems in public service procurement in the Republic of South Africa, the most precise aspect of these public services is their provision in native languages.

#### 4. CONCLUSION

The Republic of South Africa is the country with the longest history of racism. Both the white and black South Africans bear considerable diversities among themselves. The British and the Dutch sovereignty continued- with English and Afrikaans being the official languages- until 1994 when the country switched to democracy as a whole following the social agreement established since 1990. During this transformation, official languages were determined according to the population structures in the provinces established. It was decided to provide public services on condition of being in at least two official languages to be constitutionally secured.

The Republic of South Africa made English, a heritage from the colonial past, into the common tongue to be used by the people with different native languages. In addition, English education is provided mainly for the students coming from the Francophone countries of Africa. The country is the most attractive one in South Africa for students and has the highest rate of English instruction. It provides considerable employment opportunities as well.

Through the recognition of English and Afrikaans as official languages for the Whites and the recognition of Xhosa, Zulu, Sesotho, Setswana, Sepedi, Songa, Siswati, Tsehivenda and Ndebele for the Blacks after 1994, efforts were made to eliminate the unrest that had been caused by the exclusion of a substantial part of the society from the state until 1994. This practice did not only bring about social peace but also enabled the creation of a sense of belonging for different groups in the same state. The provincial system of South Africa is grounded on languages. Thanks to the linguistic freedom in South Africa, it remains quite out of the question for these differences to bear separatist ideas.

South African Anglican bishop, Nobel Peace Prize laureate and cleric who has an important place in the struggle of the black South Africans.

In English, the names of the language and the nation are the same. Language is the primary factor that generates the concept of nation today since language also harbors the culture of the past. The language, with this feature, is of great importance in terms of forming a collective memory for a nation. This also creates the difference of a nation or an ethnic group from another. The language, bearing all these features, has the nature of growing separatist and dividing the country in the event of being excluded from within the state. Yet why would a language that seeks to be official and to be used in the state try to divide that very country anyway? In short, an official language that is included in the state is at the same time a symbol of unity. It is very important with regard to the establishment of democracy to take this sensitivity into consideration while forming public policies in countries with social differences. This action also satisfies the people's notion of state and obviates other searches. Briefly stated, acknowledging each other makes differences forgotten, while exclusion keeps past and present differences alive and prepares the ground for a conflict environment.

The provision of public services in native languages is as important as their expediency also in terms of decentralization. While education, health, banking and social benefits are important in public services, so is the procurement of the provided services in a thoroughgoing and befitting way. Public services could well be provided in one single language. However, in the countries that are home to different communities, the true service is to be able to become the very language of those communities.

## References

- Alexander, N. (2013). Thoughts on the New South Africa. Johannesburg: Jacana Media.
- Baker, C. (2011). Foundations of bilingual education and bilingualism. Bristol: Multilingual Matters.
- Ball, J. (2010). Enhancing learning of children from diverse language backgrounds: Mother tongue- based bilingual or multilungual education in early childhood and early primary school years, Canadian Electronic Library. Canada. Retrieved from https://policycommons.net/artifacts/1215089/enhancing-learning-of-children-from-diverse-language-backgrounds/1768190/.
- BBC, (2023). South Africa profile- Timeline. Retrieved from https://www.bbc. com/news/world-africa-14094918.
- Beukes, A. M. (2009). Language policy incongruity and African languages in postapartheid South Africa, Language Matters, 40(1), 35-55.
- Chomsky, N. (2013). Demokrasi ve eğitim, C.P. Otero, (ed.) İstanbul: Bgst Yayınları.
- Chumbow, B. S. (2009). Linguistic diversity, pluralism and national development in Africa. Africa Development, 34(2), 21-45.
- Documan Portal, (2016). George Municipality Communication Policy, Strategy, Action Plan. Retrieved from https://documentportal.george.gov.za/ storage/communication-policies/May2020/011Fott1W58twlMI3c72. pdf
- Ergil, D. (2016). Siyasi aklın sürçtüğü yer, Kürt sorunu. Ankara: Gece Kitaplığı.
- Eryılmaz, B. (2011). Kamu yönetimi. Ankara: Okutman Yayıncılık.
- Harold Laswell, (1951). "The policy orientation", The policy sciences: Recent developments in scope and method. In D. Lerner & H. Laswell (Eds.), Stanford: Stanford University.
- Hartshorne, K. B. (1992). Crisis and challenges: Black education. 1910-1990. Cape Town: South Africa. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hasan Hüseyin Çevik, (2013), Kamu Politikası Kuram ve Uygulama. In M. Yıldız & M. Zahid Sobacı (Eds.), Ankara: Yetkin Yayınları.
- Hazeltine, R. (2013). Language Policy and Education in Multilingual South Africa. HOHONU, 11, 25-29.
- Hlongwa, N.N. & Mazibuko, G. (2016). IsiZulu at the University of KwaZulu-Natal: Prospects for teaching isiZulu as a second language for specific purposes. In R.H. Kaschula, & E. Wolff (Eds), Additional language teaching and use in multilingual education in Africa: Concepts and practices. Pretoria: UNISA, 149-161.

- Hukuk Book, (2021 Kasım 5). Avrupa bölgesel ve azınlık dilleri şartı. Retrieved from https://hukukbook.com/avrupa-bolgesel-ve-azinlik-dilleri-sarti/.
- Ideh, A. E. & Onu, J. O. (2017). Multilingualism and the new language policy in South Africa: Innovation and challenges. Covenant Journal of Language Studies (CJLS), 5(2), 65-83.
- Kgatla M. A. (2016). Review of language policy of the blouberg municipality: a summative evaluation (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). School of Languages and Communication Studies of The University of Limpopo.
- Koçak, M. (2013). Çokkültürlülük açısından dil hakları. Ankara: Liberte Yayınları.
- Kothari, R. (1970). *Politics In india*. Boston: Little, Brown and Company.
- Kymlicka, W. (1998). Çokkültürlü yurttaşlık: Azınlık haklarının Liberal teorisi, (A. Yılmaz Çev.). İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.
- Lijphart, A. (2014). Demokrasi modelleri, İthaki. İstanbul: Penguen Kitap Basım.
- Maps on the Web, (2016). South Africa's 11 official languages. Retrieved https://mapsontheweb.zoom-maps.com/post/143106698226/ south-africas-11-official-languages-zulu-is
- Marthie N. (2007). Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University language policy. Retriewed from https://nmbm.co.za/DataRepository/Documents/nmbm-language-policy.pdf
- Mazrui, A. A. & Mazrui, A. M. (1998). The power of Babel: Language and governance in the African experience. Oxford: James Currey.
- Minister of Justice And Correctional Services, (2019). Policy on the use of official languages in the department of justice and constitutional development, Government Gazette, Staatskoerant, 26 April 2019, No. 42422. Retrieved from https://www.justice.gov.za/legislation/notices/2019/20190426-gg42422gon616-DOJlanguagepolicy.pdf
- Murray, C., & Simeon, R. (2007). Recognition without empowerment: Minorities in a democratic South Africa. International Journal of Constitutional Law, 5(4), 699-729.
- Nomlomo, V., & Katiya, M. (2018), Multilingualism and (Bi)Literacy Development for Epistemological Access: Exploring Students Experience in the Use of Multilingual Glossaries at a South African University, Educational Research for Social Change (ERSC), 7(1), 77-93.
- Ohyama M. (2018). The impact of language policy in South Af-Retrieved https://capechameleon.co.za/ rica, from the-impact-of-language-policy-in-south-africa/.
- Orhan Gökhan, (2013). Kamu politikası kuram ve uygulama. M. Yıldız & M. Zahid Sobacı (Ed.). Ankara: Yetkin Yayınları.
- Pluddemann, P. (1997). Additive and subtractive: Challenges in education for multilingualism. Per Linguam, 13(1), 17-28.

- Possel, D. & Zeller, J. (2016). Language shift or increased bilingualism in South Africa: Evidence from census data. Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development, 37(4), 357-370.
- Sekhukhune District Municipality, (2017). Language policy. Retrieved from https://www.sekhukhunedistrict.gov.za/sdm-admin/documents/Language%20policy%20 final.pdf
- The Constitution of The Republic of South Africa (1996). Retrieved from http://www.justice.gov.za/legislation/constitution/SAConstitution-web-eng.pdf.
- Ulusoy, K. (2020). Katalanlar. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.
- Utku, A. (2004). Ludwig Wittgenstein, erken dönemlerinde dilin sınırları ve felsefe (Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi). Atatürk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Erzurum.
- Wallensteen, P. & Sollenberg, M. (2000). Armed conflict, 1989-99. Journal of Peace Research, 37(5), 635-649.
- Wilson W. (1887). The study of administration. Retrieved from http://thf media.s3.amazonaws.com/CPP/FP\_PS18.pdf, 01.01.2021.